

MEETING DATE: JUNE 22, 2005

SUBJECT: Post-Implementation Review 42 Cummer Weekday Midday Service To Middlefield Road

RECOMMENDATIONS

It is recommended that the Commission:

1. Approve the elimination of trial Monday to Friday midday service on the 42A CUMMER route, east of Kennedy Road, effective October 17, 2005, because of unsatisfactory ridership and financial performance; and
2. Forward this report to City of Toronto Councillors Balkissoon and Del Grande, and the City of Toronto.

FUNDING

The elimination of this trial service would result in annual savings of approximately \$33,500 in net direct costs.

BACKGROUND

This report is the post-implementation review of Monday to Friday midday service on the 42A CUMMER route, east of Kennedy Road to Middlefield Road.

At its meeting on June 16, 2004, the Commission approved:

That staff be directed to extend the 42 CUMMER route east of Kennedy Road on a six month trial basis commencing September 2004, with a report back on the results of this change at the conclusion of the trial.

This service began a trial period of operation in September 2004, as directed by the Commission.

A map of the 42 CUMMER route is shown in Exhibit 1.

DISCUSSION

Post-Implementation Reviews

The TTC uses a formal process for planning and evaluating service changes based on a set of Commission-approved service standards. Every new service that the TTC introduces is initially operated on a trial basis. After a minimum six-month trial period, when ridership on the service has approached a mature state, passenger counts are taken, the performance of the route is reviewed, and a recommendation is made regarding its future. All service changes are reviewed to ensure that the original objective of better service for customers has been met. New routes and extensions, which have been introduced at an additional cost, undergo a ridership and financial review to check that the service has met established standards of acceptable financial performance. The overall review also considers comments that have been received from customers and the community, and the experience that has been gained in operating the service.

A service change, which has met its performance objectives, is recommended to be made a regular part of the TTC system. If a service change has been unsuccessful in some way, then a recommendation is made to either make further changes for another trial period or to remove the service. The compulsory post-implementation review of every trial service change ensures that the success or failure of every service change is assessed consistently and fairly, and that there is full accountability to the Commission on matters which affect the service that is provided to customers.

Most service changes implemented through this process have been successful. Of the 61 trial service changes made since 1998, 44 of the changes attracted sufficient ridership that they meet the TTC's financial performance targets, and are now a regular part of the TTC system.

New midday service east of Kennedy Road

The new midday service on the 42A CUMMER route, east of Kennedy Road to Middlefield Road, began on Tuesday, September 7, 2004. Before the change was made, service on the 42A CUMMER route operated east of Kennedy Road to Middlefield Road only during the peak periods from Monday to Friday. Service during the midday from Monday to Friday operated only as far east as Kennedy Road. The new extended midday service operates every 30 minutes, from approximately 9:45 a.m. to 2:15 p.m., Monday to Friday. One bus was added to operate the new midday service. Operation of the new service east of Kennedy Road costs approximately \$33,500 per year in net direct operating costs.

New midday service east of Kennedy Road was originally considered as part of the report on *Service Improvements for 2004*, but was not recommended as the service was not expected to attract enough ridership to achieve the TTC's minimum financial standards. It was forecast that approximately 125 passenger-trips per day would use the new midday service east of Kennedy Road service where 175 per day would be needed to achieve acceptable financial performance.

Councillors Del Grande and Balkissoon requested that the trial service proceed because they had received many requests for service from residents in the area and they believed that the ridership could be higher than forecast. The Councillors noted there are elderly care/retirement homes served by the route, notably, the Yee Hong Centre for Geriatric Care at 2311 McNicoll Avenue, and the Monsheong Scarborough Long-Term Care Centre at 2030 McNicoll Avenue that may generate more transit ridership than is typical for areas such as this. On this basis, the Commission agreed to proceed with the trial service.

Ridership on the New Service

Counts of passengers on the trial service show that approximately 80 customer-trips are made each day on the new service which is significantly less than the ridership required to meet acceptable financial standards. The number of new customer-trips on the service attracted to the TTC is estimated to be less than 15 each day. The financial performance of the new service is 0.09 new customers per net direct dollar of operating cost, which is below the minimum standard of 0.23.

There is no opportunity to reduce the operating costs of the new midday service. One bus was added to operate the service, and so less service cannot be operated. Operation of a midday service over a shorter distance would not substantially reduce costs, as one additional bus would still be required.

Because the new service does not meet the minimum financial standard, and there is no prospect of reducing costs or improving the financial performance of the service, it is recommended that midday service east of Kennedy Road be eliminated, effective Monday, October 17, 2005. The last day of service would be Friday, October 14, 2005.

With this change, service east of Kennedy Road to Middlefield Road on the 42A CUMMER route would operate during the peak periods only, from approximately 6:45 a.m. to 9:45 a.m. and from 2:15 p.m. to 6:20 p.m. Customers who now use the midday service east of Kennedy Road will have to walk to the remaining 42 CUMMER service on McNicoll Avenue, just west of Kennedy Road; or walk to bus stops on the 43 KENNEDY, 57 MIDLAND, 21 BRIMLEY, 129 MCCOWAN NORTH, or 130 MIDDLEFIELD routes.

Customer and Community Comments

Since the route extension began operation in September 2004, three formal communications have been received by the TTC expressing dissatisfaction with the new service, citing infrequent service and low ridership.

Operational Issues

The operation of the new midday service has been satisfactory.

JUSTIFICATION

The post-implementation review of the trial period of operation of new services is an important part of the TTC's service standards. The 42A CUMMER midday service east of Kennedy Road does not meet the minimum financial performance standards and so should be discontinued.

June 15, 2005

11-57-57/82

Attachment: Exhibit 1 – 42 CUMMER route map

Exhibit 1 – 42 CUMMER route map